

Review worksheet

Reference: Elwood, MJ (1988) Causal Relationships in Medicine, Oxford University Press, London.

Title

Authors

Is the contribution to knowledge new and substantial?

Recommendation

Accept article as is.

Accept article with minor modifications (details below).

Accept article with revision (details below).

Accept article with major revision (details below) and re-review.

Reject article – unsuitable for publication (details below).

Description of the evidence

What relationship was evaluated?

What was the hypothesis?

What was the study design?

What were the exposure variables?

What was the outcome variable(s)?

What was the source population?

What was the eligible population?

What was the study population?

What was the time frame of interest?

What was the geographic area of interest?

What were the main results of the study?

Internal validity

Does the evidence support a causal relationship or just an association between outcome and exposure?

Non-causal explanations

Evidence of bias?

Evidence of confounding?

Evidence of chance?

Causal explanations

Temporal relationship between outcome and exposure?

Strength of association?

Dose-response relationship?

Consistency?

Specificity?

External validity

Can the results be applied to the eligible population?

Can the results be applied to the source population?

Can the results be applied to other populations?

Comparison with other evidence

Are the results consistent with other evidence?

Does the total evidence suggest specificity?

Are the results biologically plausible?

Is there coherency in the distribution of exposure and outcome?

Miscellaneous

Study size and power calculations?

Are the statistical analyses appropriate?

Are the results presented appropriately?

Are the conclusions drawn from statistical analyses appropriate?

Are all references to other work justified?

Is all work by other scientists that is referred to adequately acknowledged?

Has the author omitted any reference to any significant work in the same field?

Minor comments